



**NationalArts
PolicyRoundtable**

A Program of **Americans for the Arts**

2010

FINAL REPORT

*The Role of the Arts in Educating America
for Great Leadership and Economic Strength*

*September 23 – 25, 2010
The Redford Conference Center at the
Sundance Resort and Preserve
Sundance, UT*

A Message from the Co Conveners ...

We founded the Americans for the Arts National Arts Policy Roundtable at Sundance together in 2006 to bring to the table a wide cross-section of people who care about advancing the arts in our country as much as we do—and are willing to work together to figure out how we can collectively make a difference. Since then, nearly 100 decision-makers and thought leaders from the public and private sectors have convened to address issues such as the future of private sector funding for the arts and the role of the arts in nurturing civic engagement and dialogue, developing a more creative and innovate workforce, and building connected global communities.

At each gathering, the charge to these thoughtful and creative individuals has been to consider the issue, and over the course of three days, work together to identify the strategies needed to move from thought to action.

We are pleased to present the final report and recommendations from the 2010 Americans for the Arts National Arts Policy Roundtable at Sundance. This year's topic, *The Role of the Arts in Educating America for Great Leadership and Economic Strength*, is important to us all. As a country, we face enormous challenges—from the economy to the environment to maintaining our global competitiveness. Overcoming these challenges requires both vision and the know-how to make it happen. Education remains at the heart of whether our young people and our workers will be prepared to meet these challenges head on.

Can the arts play a role? We know they can—and if we are to succeed, we know they must. As more employers recognize the value of creativity and innovation, we must ensure the arts are understood as a critical part of building a workforce steeped in innovative capabilities. With the United States facing a 70 percent high school graduation rate, we must create vibrant learning environments that engage students by unlocking their creative potential and build the confidence that helps them succeed. The arts are not only what is needed to *reform* education—they can *transform* it. Our task is to ensure the policies, practices, and resources are in place to bring this vision to reality.

We would like to express our gratitude to the Hewlett Foundation, the NAMM Foundation, and The Ruth Lilly Fund of Americans for the Arts for support of the 2010 National Arts Policy Roundtable.



SUNDANCE
INSTITUTE

NationalArts
PolicyRoundtable
A Division of Americans for the Arts

Robert L. Lynch
President & CEO, Americans for the Arts

Robert Redford
Founder, Sundance Institute

Table of Contents

A Message from the Co Conveners ...	3
Introduction.....	5
The Imperative	6
Is America Facing a “Creativity Crisis”?.....	6
Arts = Creativity = Competitive Edge	6
Creativity—The Skill Employers and School Administrators Value	6
Creativity—A Global Imperative.....	7
Following a Global Roadmap	8
Addressing Global Challenges—The Seoul Agenda.....	9
A Nation Still At Risk: Can the Arts Help?.....	10
The Arts’ Impact on Learning and Workplace Skills	10
The Arts’ Impact on Closing the Graduation Gap.....	11
Your Brain on Arts	13
2010 Recommendations.....	14
1. Messaging and Casemaking.....	14
Demonstrate the link between the arts and other reform priorities, such as creativity, innovation and global competitiveness	14
2. Research	15
Demonstrate the impact of arts learning on the development of 21 st century skills.....	15
3. Strategic Alliances.....	16
Strengthen connections with key influencers in business, philanthropy and the millennial generation	16
4. Public Policy.....	18
Focus on reforming Federal policy in order to leverage policy change down the state-to-local pipeline	18
About the National Arts Policy Roundtable.....	20
About Americans for the Arts	21
About Sundance Institute	21
Acknowledgements	22
2010 Participants.....	23
Citations.....	24

Introduction

In a global economy where innovation drives prosperity, the United States faces increasing competition from around the world in maintaining its competitiveness. Business, education, and community leaders believe that education is core to whether our young people and workers will be prepared to meet these economic challenges. Yet, they also see the need to *re-imagine* as well as re-invest in American public education in order to improve workforce readiness, provide national security, and ensure our students have the skills, knowledge, and creativity to compete successfully in a 21st-century global society.

The 2010 National Arts Policy Roundtable, *The Role of the Arts in Educating America for Great Leadership and Economic Strength*, focused on the role of the arts in answering the national imperative to improve education in order to meet the global challenges we face.

How can the arts help improve education in order to meet these global challenges? To answer this question, 30 leaders from business, government, philanthropy, military,

“The Creative Economy... relies upon people who can think creatively, adapt quickly to new situation, and problem-solve. This industry, which is growing at a faster pace than total U.S. business growth, increases the demand for workers with the skills that are gained through the arts in education.”

Governor’s Commission on the Arts in Education: Education Commission on the States, 2006

education and the arts convened on September 23–25, 2010, for the fifth annual Americans for the Arts National Arts Policy Roundtable at the Sundance Resort and Preserve in Utah’s Wasatch Mountains.

“All of you know the history all too well. For decades, arts education has been treated as though it was the novice teacher at school, the last hired and first fired when times get tough. But President Obama, the First Lady, and I reject the notion that the arts, history, foreign languages, geography, and civics are ornamental offerings that can or should be cut from schools during a fiscal crunch. The truth is that, in the information age, a well-rounded curriculum is not a luxury but a necessity.”

Arne Duncan, US Secretary of Education, April 9, 2010

Participants agreed that, as the federal government considers the next steps in public education, the increasing involvement of philanthropy and the business community creates new opportunities for leaders across sectors to work together to bring about change.

This report summarizes the pre-conference briefing materials as well as the content presented to participants on site to help catalyze their discussions. The resulting recommendations provide opportunity to continue this important dialogue across sectors—and on behalf of America’s children.

The Imperative

Is America Facing a “Creativity Crisis”?

On July 10, 2010, a *Newsweek* headline provocatively proclaimed that the United States was in “The Creativity Crisis,” citing evidence that shows for the first time in 50 years, American creativity is on the decline.¹ The *Newsweek* article reported that Kyung Hee Kim, a professor at the College of William & Mary, found creativity scores have been consistently inching downward since 1990, after analyzing almost 300,000 Torrance Test of Creative Thinking scores of children and adults.

Numerous reports from both business and education have suggested a need to rethink how schools are educating children to effectively thrive in work and life in the 21st-Century. The 2006 report, “Tough Choices or Tough Times”², from the New Commission on the Skills of the American Workforce noted that education systems in the

United States were built for an era that no longer exists—the industrial economy of the 20th century—and our ability to get where we need to be can only happen by changing the system itself.³

“...other countries are making creativity development a national priority...The European Union designated 2009 as the European Year of Creativity and Innovation, holding conferences on the neuroscience of creativity, financing teacher training, and instituting problem-based learning programs...for both children and adults. In China there has been widespread education reform to extinguish the drill-and-kill teaching style. Instead, Chinese schools are also adopting a problem-based learning approach.”

“The Creativity Crisis” *Newsweek*, July, 2010

Arts = Creativity = Competitive Edge

Creativity—The Skill Employers and School Administrators Value

The 2006 report, *Are They Really Ready to Work?*, issued by The Conference Board, Partnership for 21st Century Skills, Corporate Voices for Working Families and the Society for Human Resource Management, found that employers believe that **applied skills**, such as critical thinking, problem solving, teamwork, and creativity/innovation, will surpass **basic knowledge** such as reading comprehension, mathematics, science, and history/geography on the combined list of skills that respondents say will increase in importance over the next five years. Of those skills, creativity/innovation ranks among the top five.

In November 2007, The Conference Board and Americans for the Arts in partnership with the American Association of School Administrators conducted a survey of public school superintendents and American business executives to identify and compare their views surrounding creativity.



In the subsequent study, *Ready to Innovate*, business leaders agreed that innovation is essential to competitive advantage, and are placing greater value on finding and employing creative workers.

But, are the arts being connected to creativity? The findings suggest the answer is yes, arts-related study in college was found to be a key creativity indicator to potential employers. School superintendents rank the *arts degree* study as the highest indicator of creativity, while employers rank an *arts degree* and *self-employed work* as the top two indicators of creativity. Yet, the study also points out that fewer than one in 10 companies reported providing any kind of creativity training options to all their employees. Most high schools offer arts classes on an elective basis only. Creative writing is the sole required course in more than half the districts. Fewer than one in 5 districts require a music class.

“...both sectors see involvement in the arts and other work experience as markers of creativity...it is clear that the arts—music, creative writing, drawing, dance—provide skills sought by employers of the third millennium.”
Ready to Innovate,
Conference Board, 2008

Creativity—A Global Imperative

In a global economy, the cultivation of employees’ minds is more important than ever. The IBM 2010 Global CEO Study surveyed 1,500 chief executive officers from 60 countries and 33 industries worldwide, finding that CEOs believe that creativity helps employees capitalize on complexity. The study also found that creativity is believed to be the most important leadership quality.⁴



Historically, the United States has held the reputation for producing highly imaginative and innovative minds in the creative as well as scientific and high-tech industries—yet recent studies are casting doubt that we will continue to do so. The reality of the global economy is that with the right education, proper motivation and technology, creative workers aren’t bound to specific locations. Knowledge work can take place anywhere in the world. With the world as the hiring pool, the question, posed by the American Management Association, is “will U.S. companies be able to attract top talent from abroad in coming years? And, even if they can, will it be less expensive and more efficient to just create innovation facilities in other nations and utilize the talent there?”⁵

The answer, they say, is that America must be able to do things other countries cannot.

In October 2010, the State University of New York reported that it was ending its French, Italian, Classics, Russian and theater degree programs⁶. The same year, *The Chronicle of Higher Education* reported that China, in contrast, was creating more opportunities for liberal arts and humanities⁷, even establishing the first Chinese liberal arts university. Why is it that in times of economic hardship, the US has been cutting funds that affect arts and humanities education, while China is increasing its investment?

Following a Global Roadmap

The international community has laid a solid groundwork for promoting and improving arts education. As early as 1972, UNESCO asked member states to submit reports detailing their arts education activities and policies. The arts education policies from twelve responding members—Nigeria, Argentina, the United States, India, Japan, Czechoslovakia (former), France, Federal Republic of Germany (former), Italy, the United Kingdom, USSR (former), and Australia helped create the world's first mini-compendium on arts education policy and practice.

Twenty-seven years later in 1999 Koïchiro Matsuura, the then Director-General of UNESCO, issued the *International Appeal for the Promotion of Arts Education and Creativity at School*. In his statement, the Director-General argued that educational systems around the world were contributing to global instability by failing to help students acquire important emotional skills. The solution, he declared, was a balanced school curriculum, where the arts and human sciences would be accorded the same significance as math and physical sciences.

The *International Appeal* launched a multiphase UNESCO arts education initiative. Between 2000 and 2003, experts met regionally in Africa, Latin America & the Caribbean, the Arab States, the Pacific, Europe and Asia. These intraregional exchanges led to the First World Conference on Arts Education: Building



Creative Capacities for the 21st Century. Held in Lisbon, Portugal, the 2006 conference charged delegates from UNESCO member states, as well as arts education experts from non-member countries, with exploring “the role of Arts Education in meeting the need for creativity and cultural awareness.”⁸ These delegates approved a capstone document titled the *Road Map for Arts Education*, which formalized international consensus on the value of arts education and gave its proponents a powerful catalyst for action.

The *Road Map for Arts Education* serves “to promote a common understanding among all stakeholders of the importance of Arts

Education and its essential role in improving the quality of education.”⁹ Informed by the diversity of arts education practices that exist worldwide, Road Map 2006 fully embraces arts education in all forms and provides several strategies for proponents to carry out. Since its release, UNESCO has tracked member states’ activities related to implementing the Road Map. The results of an international survey, released at the 2010 World Conference on Arts Education in Seoul, South Korea, indicate that as of May 2010, 59 countries (73 percent of respondents) have distributed the *Road Map for Arts Education* to domestic stakeholders, and 21 other members states are in the queue for distribution. The Road Map has been translated into 20 languages. While much more work is needed, many countries have made notable progress.¹⁰

Addressing Global Challenges—The Seoul Agenda

The 2010 World Conference on Arts Education allowed the global community of experts to take stock, exchange best practices, and set new priorities for the future. Building on the Road Map, participants in the Seoul Conference advanced the worldwide arts education campaign one step further, producing a new manifesto.

The Seoul Agenda, as it is simply known, differs from its predecessor by focusing on arts education as a means to address global challenges. In the third objective, to “apply arts education principles and practices to contribute to resolving the social and cultural challenges facing today’s world,” the Seoul Agenda extends the role of arts education beyond improving classroom conditions to also address social problems, prepare future workers, promote cultural understanding, and secure geopolitical stability.

UNESCO’s agenda represents a shift in the global conversation about arts education. The Seoul Agenda places arts education squarely in the savvy policymaker’s toolbox for addressing the 21st-century’s global challenges. While the days of advocating for arts education are not entirely over, the current focus is on its improvement. If America wishes to compete with other countries, it must make the change as well.

A Global Body of Evidence—Arts Impact Education

Academic Achievement

Employing musical aptitude tests, researchers in Korea show the positive relationship between musical ability and higher performance in math^{11.2}. The Education and Arts Partnership Initiative (EAPI) of Australia connects arts education and increased academic performance^{11.4} (Bamford 2006). In Singapore researchers have found marked improvement in oral language proficiency for 16-year old drama program participants^{11.6}.

Educating for Creativity

Research reveals the links between the arts and creativity. Investigations into Korea’s Creativity-Enhancing Music Programme (CEMP) revealed that participation improved students’ verbal-fluency, figural fluency, flexibility, verbal-originality, figural originality^{11.7}—skills that comprise creative ability.

Cultural Integration

Investigators have found strong evidence suggesting that arts education is instrumental in reaching out to marginalized cultural groups. In Australia, researchers have documented the success of music programs in helping indigenous populations to meet English literacy standards, giving them better access to job opportunities and thus facilitating social integration^{11.8}.

Skill Development

The *Culture Competency Record* (*Der Kompetenznachweis Kultur*) is a program funded by the German national government that trains arts educators in identifying the cognitive skills acquired by a student during arts activities. Their students, beginning at the age of 12, receive a “passport,” to track the personal, artistic, and social competencies acquired along the journey of cognitive development. Studies show that participants exhibit increased confidence and a greater capacity for self-reflection^{11.9}. When it is time for the student to apply for internships or entry-level jobs, they are able to present their passport—in addition to academic records—as evidence of acquired skills.



A Nation Still At Risk: Can the Arts Help?

The Arts' Impact on Learning and Workplace Skills

Practitioners in arts education witness daily the transformational qualities the arts instill in learners and learning environments. The challenge has always been to provide the hard data and evidence. Empirical studies across the globe have shown promising signs linking the impact of an arts education on other applied, or non-cognitive, skills:

- Students with high arts exposure showed clear evidence of an understanding of ‘multiple or alternative vantage points’.¹²
- Exposure to learning in the arts positively reinforces students’ ability to think critically.¹³
- Significantly higher mean scores on several of the subscales within the California Critical Thinking Disposition Inventory: truth seeking, maturity, and open-mindedness... these categories are highly aligned with creative exploration and the analysis of ill-structured problems with no obvious solution (proactive creativity).¹⁴



Arts education improves the employability, productivity, and cohesion of the workforce, central issues for a robust 21st-century creative workforce, with some evidence suggesting that these non-cognitive skills may be even more critical than cognitive ability in the creative economy.

- “Non-cognitive skills are more valued by some employers than particular technical skill sets. These skills, which include stability and dependability, will be in increasing demand in an economy with a growing service sector.”¹⁵

In 2006, Scottish Executive Social Research published “Arts and Employability,”¹⁶ which investigated the effect of an arts education on later employability by examining longitudinal data of 11,699 young people. Intriguing empirical findings include:

- The rate of employment appears higher among young people leaving school at a later stage who took arts subjects, compared to those who did not take arts subjects.
- Students who took at least two arts subjects at standard grade tend to have a higher rate of employment than those who took only one arts subject.

The data also show that taking arts courses in school even benefits occupations that do not require secondary education:

- Among young people leaving school at the earliest opportunity, employability is generally higher for those that had studied arts subjects.
- Students leaving school at an early stage having taken arts subjects are less likely to find themselves in a negative labor market position three years later, compared to the average young person leaving school early.
- Young people that had studied music or graphic communication are amongst the most employable of those that leave school at the earliest opportunity.

“...The clear link between drama and music and high levels of confidence is an important and positive finding...young people from lower socio-economic backgrounds gaining confidence at school, as demonstrated by drama or music students, are more likely to enjoy higher salaries and enter professional or managerial jobs.”

Arts and Employability, 2006

The Arts' Impact on Closing the Graduation Gap

By virtually every economic measure, high school graduates are better positioned to lead successful adult lives than those who fail to receive their diplomas.¹⁷ A landmark study of 10-year graduation rates entitled *Cities in Crisis 2009: Closing the Graduation Gap*¹⁸ shows staggering findings on the current status of those graduating in the United States. Experts say that dropping out of high school affects not just students and their families, but the country overall—including businesses, government, and communities. The Alliance for Excellent Education estimates that high school dropouts from the Class of 2006-2007 will cost the United States. **more than \$329 billion in lost wages, taxes, and productivity** during their lifetimes. Experts say that those who drop out are more likely to be incarcerated, rely on public programs and social services, and go without health insurance than those who graduate from high school.

- Nationwide, nearly one in three U.S. high school students fails to graduate with a diploma.
- In total, approximately 1.2 million students drop out each year – averaging 7,000 every school day or one every 26 seconds.¹⁹
- Among minority students, the problem is even more severe with nearly 50 percent of African American and Hispanic students not completing high school on time.
- As of 2006–2007, the national average graduation rate was 68.8 percent and the top three states with the highest graduation rate were New Jersey (83.3 percent), Vermont (82.3 percent), and Wisconsin (81 percent) while the bottom three states were New Mexico and South Carolina tied at 54.9 percent and Nevada (41.8 percent).²⁰

The *Cities in Crisis 2009: Closing the Graduation Gap* report reveals drop-outs:

- are less likely to be steadily employed
- earn less income when they are employed, compared with those who graduate from high school
- are more than twice as likely to live in poverty

Given these sobering statistics, can the arts provide a solution?

Studies show that access to arts education in school offers distinct benefits to economically disadvantaged youth and students at risk of dropping out.²¹ Strong arts programs can be used as a means to prevent the disengagement that usually predicts dropping out.²²

An 11-year national study that examined youth in low-income neighborhoods found that those who participated in arts programs were much more likely to:

- be high academic achievers
- be elected to class office
- participate in a math or science fair, or
- win an award for writing an essay or poem.²³

Students at risk of not successfully completing their high school education cite their participation in the arts as a reason for staying in school.

The opportunity for students to engage in the arts—through bands and choruses, dance and theater productions, exhibitions of their original art, and publications of original literary and visual work—has always been a strong motivator for students and can play a key role in tackling the graduation crisis.²⁴

“It is not surprising that visual arts instruction improves reading readiness, or that learning to play the piano or to master musical notation helps students to master math. Reading, math, and writing require students to understand and use symbols--and so does assembling shapes and colors in a portrait or using musical notes to learn fractions.

Is it any surprise then to learn of the large impact that arts education has on student achievement and attainment, especially among disadvantaged students?

*Low-income students who play in the orchestra or band are more than twice as likely to perform at the highest levels in math as peers who do not play music. In James Catterall's well-known longitudinal study, *Doing Well and Doing Good by Doing Art*, low-income students at arts-rich high schools were more than twice as likely to earn a B.A. as low-income students at arts-poor high schools.*

English language learners at arts-rich high schools were also far more likely than their peers at arts-poor high schools to go on to college.

In the annals of education research, these are big effects---and ones we would like to see more schools replicate.”

Arne Duncan, US Secretary of Education,
April 9, 2010

Your Brain on Arts

There is growing evidence that the arts contribute not just to learning across disciplines, but also to the thought process itself. In March 2008, the Dana Foundation released *Learning, Arts and the Brain, the Dana Consortium Report on Arts and Cognition* a series of studies, conducted by leading neuroscientists from seven prestigious universities.

Over a three-year period, the coordinated, multi-university study grappled with the question, “Are smart people drawn to the arts or does arts training make people smarter?”

The cognitive neuroscientists who participated in the study found a “tight correlation” between exposure to the arts and improved skills in cognition and attention for learning.²⁵ The groundbreaking scientific research was conducted by participating researchers using brain imaging studies and behavioral assessment.

Among their major findings include that children motivated in the arts develop attention skills and memory retrieval that also apply to other subject areas.

These and other findings detailed in the study advance our understanding of the effects of music, dance, and drama education on other types of learning.

The research was led by Dr. Michael S. Gazzaniga of the University of California at Santa Barbara.

“[Although] there is still a lot of work to be done... We now have further reasons to believe that training in the arts has positive benefits for more general cognitive mechanisms.”

Dr. Michael S. Gazzaniga,
University of California at Santa
Barbara, March 4, 2008.

The Consortium identified eight key points relevant to the interests of parents, students, educators, neuroscientists, and policy makers:

1. An interest in a performing art leads to a high state of motivation that produces the sustained attention necessary to improve performance and the training of attention that leads to improvement in other domains of cognition.
2. Genetic studies have begun to yield candidate genes that may help explain individual differences in interest in the arts.
3. Specific links exist between high levels of music training and the ability to manipulate information in both working and long-term memory; these links extend beyond the domain of music training.
4. In children, there appear to be specific links between the practice of music and skills in geometrical representation, though not in other forms of numerical representation.
5. Correlations exist between music training and both reading acquisition and sequence learning. One of the central predictors of early literacy, phonological awareness, is correlated with both music training and the development of a specific brain pathway.
6. Training in acting appears to lead to memory improvement through the learning of general skills for manipulating semantic information.
7. Adult self-reported interest in aesthetics is related to a temperamental factor of openness, which in turn is influenced by dopamine-related genes.
8. Learning to dance by effective observation is closely related to learning by physical practice, both in the level of achievement and also the neural substrates that support the organization of complex actions. Effective observational learning may transfer to other cognitive skills.

1. Messaging and Casemaking

Demonstrate the link between the arts and other reform priorities, such as creativity, innovation and global competitiveness

In order to build stronger support for the arts as part of education reform, stakeholders need a better understanding of the link between the arts and critical reform priorities. Helping others understand how the arts prepare students to be “career ready” and “college ready,” as well as their contributions to creativity and innovation is essential. Artists who are already engaged in public relations and media campaigns to heighten the importance of education can be encouraged to use the opportunity to speak on behalf of the arts as a critical element of student learning.



Specific strategies for connecting the arts message with reform priorities include:

- Make the case for how the arts contribute to building a better workforce and educating kids for the new marketplace by developing the “4 C”s (Creativity, Collaboration, Communication and Critical Thinking) that are recognized as key 21st century skills
 - *Demonstrate the value of turning “STEM” (Science, Technology, Engineering, Math) to “STEAM” (Science, Technology, Engineering, ARTS, Math) when messaging to corporate leaders concerned with developing critical 21st century workplace skills*
- Reinforce the message that funding the arts in schools is about achieving educational goals such as college and career readiness, keeping students engaged and in school, and leads to adults who are more creative, innovative and better prepared to deal with the challenges of the world today
- Encourage artists and other high profile spokespersons already involved in education messaging to use their platform to reinforce the importance of the arts to young people and learning



- Learn from other education messaging efforts and adopt strategies that work
 - *Create short, easy to understand and inclusive messages that are consistent with how other core subjects are discussed in the public realm (e.g. “Half a mind is a terrible thing to waste”). Make the case to the general public for more “arts in schools” versus asking for more “arts education” (e.g. ‘science’ and ‘math’, not ‘science education’ or ‘math education’)*
 - *Develop an inclusive message about the importance of the arts in schools that can incorporate more of what children and students are already interested in—pop music, media, animation, design*
 - *Promote the message that exposure to the arts is important even if the child will not become a professional artist in adulthood. Sports are promoted in schools as contributing to learning teamwork, discipline—not in helping develop professional athletes. The Arts have similar values and compelling messages*
 - *Interview successful non artists who use creativity in the workplace and ask for their comments on how the arts played a role in the people they became*



2. Research

Demonstrate the impact of arts learning on the development of 21st century skills

Though research exists, more compelling evidence must be gathered that demonstrates how arts learning and experiences create better students, more productive workers, and happier, healthier human beings. New research that targets the business community, higher education and policy makers should be undertaken to explore what kinds of arts education and experiences lead to developing critical 21st century skills, such as creativity and innovation, critical thinking, communication, and collaboration; what practices can be put in place in schools and the workplace that encourage these skills; and the impact of the arts in such outcomes as graduation and retention rates, drop-out prevention, or competitiveness in the college application process. Because the United States competes on a global scale, research should be done to compare the investments in arts education our competitor countries make versus our own. Advocacy is needed for additional resources to enhance arts education research efforts that could be conducted by entities such as the National Science Foundation and the federal Institute for Education Sciences, to demonstrate the link between arts instruction, cognitive development and learning.



Specific research areas which participants felt would contribute important information for stakeholders in the debate include:

- **(Policy Makers)** *Can we compare what resources the United States invests in arts education versus that by competitor countries?*
- **(Policy Makers)** *What kinds of arts education including “learning through the arts” and/or “learning in the arts” lead to improved educational outcomes? (e.g. increasing graduation and retention, lowering drop-out rates, improving student performance, etc.)*
- **(Business Community)** *What kinds of arts education and experiences lead to the development of 21st century skills and creativity in the workplace? (And how?)*
- **(Business Community)** *What is the most appropriate way to define and measure creativity in the workplace? (Do different stakeholders define creativity differently? Do different disciplines define creativity differently?)*
- **(Business Community)** *What are best practices for developing creativity in the workplace?*
- **(Parents/Policy Makers/Business Community)** *How does arts education and experience impact the student’s competitiveness in college application process?*



3. Strategic Alliances

Strengthen connections with key influencers in business, philanthropy and the millennial generation



Capitalize on the strong voices and opinions of millennials and encourage them to promote the importance of the arts in their everyday lives through their social networking. Create local opportunities for members of the private sector—business, foundations and individuals—to discuss and support the arts as part of the local school reform agenda. Engage with individuals and entities that are interested in educating the ‘whole child’ even if such groups are not typically focused on the arts, to determine mutual agendas and ways of working together. Examples include child mental health experts, neuroscientists, behaviorists and the US Military. Form new partnerships with volunteer associations that can mobilize quickly around a cause to develop more citizen activists willing to speak up on behalf of increasing arts in the schools.

Specific strategies for increasing and making more effective strategic alliances include:

- Establish deeper connections with millennials to voice the personal meaning of the arts to their generation and future generations by using innovative techniques to reach them, including social networking, viral video and cultural icons
 - *Demonstrate through social network messaging how the arts are already woven into the fabric of millennials' lives and encourage them to repurpose this message in their social networking*

- Strengthen outreach efforts to individuals as well as the corporate and foundation sectors that help



them connect how the arts help achieve their education goals. Provide speakers to local chapters of business groups, host workshops or sessions at major conferences where these constituents gather



- Strengthen ties with elected officials and build strong networks of community leaders and activists who can support and advise elected officials on arts education policy
- Form unexpected partnerships and align education reform agendas with entities that are interested in education the 'whole child'—even if such group are not typically focused on the arts

- *Engage with the practitioners, child mental health experts, neuroscientists, behaviorists—who believe in the power of the arts to transform a child—to exchange information and develop joint messages supportive of the inclusion of the arts in schools*
- *Seek allies among the United States Military who are educating young people and view the need for a creative, innovative and well-educated citizenry as a matter of national security*
- *Connect with Volunteer Associations that mobilize quickly and pointedly around a cause (e.g. Rotary Club) that may be interested in arts support and already have a citizen base*



4. Public Policy

Focus on reforming Federal policy in order to leverage policy change down the state-to-local pipeline

Advocate for more inter-agency discussions and investments at the federal level that support the arts in the broader education agenda, including issues of equity of access for all students, as well as improving college and career-readiness and workforce development. Encourage the US Department of Education to focus on state/school district compliance with regulations already in place that support arts education as well as to make existing revenue streams focused on innovation, school remediation, etc. available to support the arts. To enhance America's ability to compete in the global economy, thus advancing domestic policy goals, the United States could consider joining UNESCO's arts education campaign which, through its "Road Map for Arts Education," is enabling a global community of experts to develop policies, conduct research, exchange best practices, and set new priorities for 21st century learning throughout the world.



Specific strategies for strengthening public policy for arts education include:

- Strengthen compliance with existing federal and state mandates that are already in place in the No Child Left Behind (NCLB) and Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA) legislation
 - *Require states to report on the extent to which arts programs, curriculum, qualified teachers and access to community arts resources are available to all students*
- Broaden the legislative language to be more inclusive of the arts in new and existing programs at the US Department of Education
 - *Encourage greater access for the arts to federal education funding streams that support innovation, STEM (Science, Engineering, Technology, Math) education, drop-out prevention or college and career readiness*
- Encourage the US Department of Education to strengthen arts education in existing and proposed programs relating to afterschool/extended learning, teaching effectiveness, school turnaround, charter schools, and student assessment
 - *Promote the arts as a matter of equity in education*
 - *Identify and remove those policies and mandated remedies that often penalize students in low performing districts by, in effect, forcing the arts from their curriculum*
 - *Allow school districts to fund arts programs as part of their intervention strategy for remediating low performing schools*

- Encourage inter-agency and public/private sector cooperation and dialogue among the Department of Education, Department of Defense, Department of Labor, and the Department of Housing and Urban Development, as well as the US Chamber of Commerce and Business Roundtable, on strategies that recognize the role of the arts in improving college and career readiness, and workforce development
 - *Help business leaders and school administrators recognize the value of including the arts in a robust STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, Math) curriculum and understand how the arts are essential to developing applied skills.*
- Advocate for the return of creativity to the classroom by encouraging schools and their partners to adopt curriculum reform and innovative ways to deliver instruction in and through the arts
 - *Assist arts educators and teaching artists in better understanding and articulating the critical role the arts play in the larger arena of education reform by developing applied skills such as communication, collaboration, creativity/innovation and critical thinking*
- At the beginning of the 21st century, America's international colleagues declared their intent to promote the arts in learning demonstrated by their continued progress on implementing the policy recommendations set forth in the UNESCO Road Map for Arts Education. The United States should consider formally joining UNESCO's global campaign for arts education, minimally by appointing a UNESCO Chair in arts education. The appointment of such an individual would signal America's return to global leadership in creativity and help advance domestic policy goals for education by opening up access to global research, best practices in the arts for practitioners here at home.



About the National Arts Policy Roundtable

The Americans for the Arts National Arts Policy Roundtable is an annual forum of national leaders who share a commitment to the arts and a willingness to meet and recommend policies critical to the advancement of American culture and society. The Roundtable is composed of distinguished individuals who serve at the highest levels of business, government, philanthropy, education, and the arts. Americans for the Arts and Sundance Institute are co-conveners of the Roundtable—teaming the two preeminent national organizations dedicated to advancing the arts and creative industries in the United States.

The Roundtable was established on the premise that issues important to the arts are also important to society—addressing social and educational needs, promoting economic prosperity, enhancing innovation, growing the creative workforce, and fostering diplomacy and cultural exchange. It is the distinctive mission of the Roundtable to elevate these issues by giving them national prominence in a forum of informed discussion—one that will yield public policy options, private sector practices, and identify key research needs.



The National Arts Policy Roundtable is the pinnacle convening of more than 100 meetings sponsored annually by Americans for the Arts—conferences that enable government and business leaders, scholars, funders, arts agency directors, and others to network, share knowledge, and proffer policies for consideration by the Roundtable. Policies recommended by the Roundtable are, in turn, circulated back to these networks for implementation.

For more information visit: www.AmericansForTheArts.org/go/policyroundtable

About Americans for the Arts

With more than 50 years of service, **Americans for the Arts** is the leading nonprofit organization committed to advancing the arts in America. Americans for the Arts believes that all the arts are critically important; that the arts are essential to the health and wealth of our communities; and that every American should have opportunities to experience the arts and arts education. Americans for the Arts works to achieve three “ends:” supporting the development of locally appropriate environments in which the arts can thrive; advocating for increased resources for the arts and arts education throughout America; and working hard to foster individual understanding of and appreciation for the arts. Americans for the Arts has four key program areas: research and policy; advocacy; professional development; and visibility. This work embraces a rich array of activities, including studies of the arts’ impact on our economy and the workforce; online networks and software tools that enable arts professionals to share knowledge with one another and citizens to communicate with their elected officials; conferences and specialized training workshops; and visibility programs. Americans for the Arts is committed to the excellence of its services and to their breadth and reach across all geographies, ethnicities, ages, educations, and levels of arts experience. With offices in Washington, D.C. and New York, Americans for the Arts provides tailored services for its members as well as free information, online advocacy tools, and research data to thousands of additional stakeholders all across the country, including local, state, and national arts organizations; government agencies; business leaders; individual philanthropists, and; educators.

www.AmericansfortheArts.org.



About Sundance Institute

Sundance Institute is a global nonprofit organization founded by Robert Redford in 1981 to promote independent storytelling to inform, inspire, and unite diverse populations around the world. Through its six artistic development programs: Feature Film, Documentary Film, Theatre, Film Music, Native and Indigenous Program and the Sundance Film Festival -- the Institute seeks to discover and support independent film and theatre artists from the United States and around the world, and to introduce audiences to their new work. What began as a retreat for a handful of artists has today expanded to serve composers, directors, editors, playwrights and screenwriters worldwide. Each year, the Institute brings international artists to the United States to develop their work in uniquely creative ‘labs’ alongside American artists and under the guidance of acclaimed advisors, all experts in their fields. The Institute has also adapted this model for use in other countries, working with local partners to engage artists on their home soil. Internationally recognized for its annual Sundance Film Festival, Sundance Institute has nurtured such projects as *Born into Brothels*, *Son of Babylon*, *Amreeka*, *An Inconvenient Truth*, *Precious*, *Winter’s Bone*, *Spring Awakening*, *Light in the Piazza* and *Angels in America*. Institute alumni have gone on to win Academy Awards, Tonys, Emmys, Grammys, and the Pulitzer Prize.

www.sundance.org



Acknowledgements

Americans for the Arts gratefully acknowledges its partner, the Sundance Institute, and the William and Flora Hewlett Foundation, the NAMM Foundation and the Ruth Lilly Fund of Americans for the Arts for support of the 2010 National Arts Policy Roundtable.



Americans for the Arts extends a special thanks to Lin Arison and Christina DePaul of YoungArts for support of performances by YoungArts Presidential Scholars, Rebecca Anderson, Kate Davis, and Benjamin Pila during the 2010 National Arts Policy Roundtable.

The Final Report from the 2010 Americans for the Arts National Arts Policy Roundtable was written and prepared by Americans for the Arts Director of Arts Policy Marete Wester and Arts Policy Coordinator Jaclyn Wood. Research on the international community's response to arts education through the work of UNESCO was conducted and presented to Roundtable participants by research consultant Eulynn Shiu.

© Americans for the Arts 2011

Photos by Fred Hayes

2010 Participants

Rebecca Anderson, 2008 YoungArts Winner in Music (Gold) and Presidential Scholar in the Arts

Lin Arison, Writer

Bob Balaban, Actor/Director/Author

Nolen V. Bivens, Brigadier General, US Army (Retired)

Jill Braufman, Chairman of the Board, Center for Arts Education

Ian Brennan, Co-Creator/Writer, *Glee*

Randy Cohen, Vice President of Local Arts Advancement, Americans for the Arts

Kate Davis, 2009 YoungArts Winner in Jazz (Silver) and Presidential Scholar in the Arts

Christina DePaul, President & CEO, National Foundation for Advancement in the Arts

Ken Ferguson, Chairman, NBC Oklahoma

Susan Fredston-Hermann, member, Utah Advisory Board, Sundance Institute

Marian Godfrey, Senior Director, The Pew Charitable Trusts & Chair, National Arts Policy Roundtable

Rachel Goslins, Executive Director, President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities

Nora Halpern, Vice President of Leadership Alliances, Americans for the Arts

Frank Hodsoll, President, Hodsoll and Associates

Fred Lazarus, President, Maryland Institute College of Art

Helen Littlejohn, Senior Regional Public Affairs Specialist, US Department of Education

Mary Luehrsen, President, NAMM Foundation

Robert Lynch, President & CEO, Americans for the Arts

Tim McClimon, President, American Express Foundation

Jill Miller, Managing Director, Sundance Institute

Benjamin Pila, 2002 YoungArts Winner in Music (Silver) and Presidential Scholar in the Arts

Keri Putnam, Executive Director, Sundance Institute

Eulynn Shiu, Consultant, Robert Bosch Foundation Fellow

Jonathan Spector, President, The Conference Board

Ryan Tarpley, Executive, CAA Foundation

Lucy Walker, Film Director

Kerry Washington, Actor, Member of the President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities

Harvey White, Chairman, (SHW)2 Enterprises

Mary Wright, Program Director, Human Capital, The Conference Board

For more information about the Americans for the Arts National Arts Policy Roundtable, visit www.AmericansForTheArts.org/go/policyroundtable

Citations

- 1 Bronson, Po and Merryman, Ashley. "The Creativity Crisis." Newsweek, July 10, 2010. <http://www.newsweek.com/2010/07/10/the-creativity-crisis.html>
- 2 "Tough Choices or Tough Times." New Commission on the Skills of the American Workforce. National Center on Education and the Economy. Washington, DC: 2007. http://www.skillscommission.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/05/ToughChoices_EXECSUM.pdf
- 3 Ibid.
- 4 IBM. "Capitalizing on Complexity: Insights from the IBM 2010 Global CEO Study." IBM. 2010. <http://www-935.ibm.com/services/us/ceo/ceostudy2010/index.html>
- 5 "The Quest for Innovation: A Global Study of Innovation Management." American Management Association. New York, NY: 2006. http://www.amanet.org/images/hri_innovation.pdf
- 6 SUNY Albany. "University at Albany Announces Measures to Rethink, Balance, and Reallocate Resources in Face of Reduced State Fiscal Support." News Center, October 1, 2010. <http://www.albany.edu/news/9902.php?WT.svl=news>
- 7 Hvistendahl, Mara. "Less Politics, More Poetry: China's Colleges Eye the Liberal Arts." *Chronicle of Higher Education* 56, no.17 (January 2010): A21-A23.
- 8 UNESCO. "Road Map for Arts Education." *The World Conference on Arts Education: Building Creative Capacities for the 21st Century*. Paris: UNESCO, 2006.
- 9 UNESCO. "Road Map for Arts Education." *The World Conference on Arts Education: Building Creative Capacities for the 21st Century*. Paris: UNESCO, 2006.
- 10 UNESCO. "Report of the survey results on the implementation of the Road Map for Arts Education." *United National Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization*. Seoul: UNESCO, 2010.
- 11 UNESCO. "Report of the survey results on the implementation of the Road Map for Arts Education." *United National Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization*. Seoul: UNESCO, 2010.
- 11.2 Jang, K-Beom. "The Effect of Musical Abilities Upon Elementary Students." *Education for Creativity: Bringing the Arts and Culture into Asian Education*, 2005: 38-42.
- 11.4 Bamford, Anne. *The Wow Factor: Global Research Compendium on the Impact of the Arts in Education*. Muenster: Waxmann, 2006.
- 11.6 Bamford, Anne. *The Wow Factor: Global Research Compendium on the Impact of the Arts in Education*. Muenster: Waxmann, 2006.
- 11.7 Parks, J.H. "The Development of a creativity-enhanced Music program for Elementary Students." Edited by L.C.R. Yip, C.C. Leung and W.T. Lau. *The Proceedings of the 4th Asian-Pacific Symposium on Music Education Research (APSMER): Curriculum Innovation in Music* (The Hong Kong Institute of Education), 2003.
- 11.8 Bamford, Anne. *The Wow Factor: Global Research Compendium on the Impact of the Arts in Education*. Muenster: Waxmann, 2006.
- 11.9 Richter, Ulrike and Franciska Mahl. Bericht über die Evaluation des Kompetenznachweises Kultur. Deutsches Jugendinstitut, München/Halle, Germany: Deutsches Jugendinstitut, 2007.
- 12Burton, J., Horowitz, R., & Abeles, H. (2000) 'Learning in and through the arts: The question of transfer.' *Studies in Art Education*, Vol. 41 no.3, 228-257.
- 13 Lampert, Nancy. "Critical Thinking Dispositions as an outcome of arts education." *Studies in Art Education*. Spring 2006, Vol. 47 no. 3.
- 14 Ibid.
- 15 ARC Centre of Excellence for Creative Industries and Innovation, 2007.
- 16 DTZ Consulting & Research. "Arts and Employability". Education Department Research Council. Research Findings. No. 22. 2006. Scotland. <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/160091/0043606.pdf>
- 17 Swanson, Christophe B. *Cities in Crisis 2009: Closing the Graduation Gap. America's Promise*. Washington, DC: April 2009. http://www.americaspromise.org/Our-Work/Dropout-Prevention/~media/Files/Our%20Work/Dropout%20Prevention/Cities%20in%20Crisis/Cities_In_Crisis_Report_2009.ashx
- 18 Ibid.
- 19 Ibid. pp. 8

-
- 20 Graduation by the Numbers. "Graduation Rate Trends 1997-2007." Education Week. Vol. 29, Issue 34
http://www.edweek.org/ew/dc/2010/gradrate_trend.html
- 21 Catterall, James S. "Involvement in the Arts and Success in Secondary School," Americans for the Arts Monographs, 1998. Vol. 1 no. 9.
[http://www.americansforthearts.org/NAPD/file/9393/Involvement%20in%20the%20Arts%20and%20Success%20in%20Secondary%20School%20\(%2798\).pdf](http://www.americansforthearts.org/NAPD/file/9393/Involvement%20in%20the%20Arts%20and%20Success%20in%20Secondary%20School%20(%2798).pdf)
- 22 Barry, Nancy H., Taylor, Jack A. and Walls, Kimberly C. "The Role of the Fine and Performing Arts in High School Dropout Prevention." Florida State University, Center for Music Research, Tallahassee, FL: 1990.
http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/13/78/9b.pdf
- 23 McLaughlin, Wilbrey M. "Community Counts: How Youth Organizations Matter for Youth Development." Public Education Network, Washington, DC: 2000.
http://www.eric.ed.gov/ERICDocs/data/ericdocs2sql/content_storage_01/0000019b/80/16/4a/65.pdf
- 24 "Staying in School: Arts Education and New York City High School Graduation Rates." Center for Arts Education. New York, NY: October 2009. http://www.cae-nyc.org/sites/default/files/docs/CAE_Arts_and_Graduation_Report.pdf
- ²⁵ Eds. Asbury, Carolyn and Rich, Barbara. "Learning, Arts and the Brain: The Dana Consortium Report on Arts and Cognition." Dana Press, New York, NY: 2008.
http://www.dana.org/uploadedfiles/news_and_publications/special_publications/learning,%20arts%20and%20the%20brain_artsandcognition_compl.pdf